History/Overview of the Florida Fish & Wildlife Conservation Commission's Work with Exotic Freshwater Fishes

> Paul Shafland, Director FWC's Non-Native Freshwater Fish Laboratory

Gulf & South Atlantic Regional Panel on Aquatic Invasive Species Miami

30 Oct 07

#### Silver Carp (Illinois River)

E

#### Walking Catfish (Clarias batrachus)

Typical Color

Albino

Asian Swamp Eel (Monopterus albus)

Red Lionfish (*Pterois volitans*)

Photo by D. Snyder

Bullseye Snakehead (Channa marulius)









some of Florida's Exotic Freshwater Fishes









34 Reproducing Species



## VALUES and BELIEFS



## **VALUE-NEUTRAL SCIENCE**



### **BISCAYNE AQUIFER**

#### **CROSS SECTION**



Thus, the success of some exotic species might better be viewed as a symptom of ecological disturbances preceding their introduction rather than a primary cause of biotic changes occurring after their introduction, although the possibility remains they could be both a symptom and later a primary cause. Moreover, one might ask if exotic freshwater fishes are primary causes of biotic change, why are their effects generally so difficult to identify and independently verify?

Another question we have struggled with is: Should we attempt to identify beneficial uses for successful exotics even though this might result in their being spread to new places?

## **A Little History**



ILLUSTRATED LIST OF FISHES WHICH REQUIRE A SPECIAL PERMIT TO IMPORT OR POSSESS IN THE STATE OF FLORIDA

FEBRUARY

#### 1972

Prepared by Vernon E. Ogilvie

Biologist



## **FWC PROGRAMS**

## PREVENTION ASSESSMENT MANAGEMENT

# #1 PREVENTION

STATE CONSTITUTION WILDLIFE CODE



## ASSESSMENT

## Non-Native Freshwater Fish Project at FAU in Boca Raton

"The accidental release of walking catfish in southern Florida ... may be the most harmful introduction to any North American area so far witnessed."

*"Its invasion of the Everglades, northern Florida, and Georgia, and perhaps the Gulf Coast states westward to Texas is inevitable."* 

Lachner et al. (1970) Exotic fishes and other Aquatic organisms introduced into North America. Smithsonian Contributions to Zoology, No. 59. "The species is a severely harmful competitor, for it apparently reduces the entire freshwater community that it invades to one common denominator, more walking catfish."

> Lachner et al. (1970) Exotic fishes and other Aquatic organisms introduced into North America. Smithsonian Contributions to Zoology, No. 59.

Walking Catfish (Clarias batrachus)



MM 12.2 Walking Catfish Renovation 1983

#### MM 12.2 Alligator Alley 1983

( Section 200

and the reason of the state of the





Bullseye Snakehead (Channa marulius)

Asian Swamp Eel (Monopterus albus)



## Asian Swamp Eel













## **Fish Community Analyses**






Percent Biomass

#### **Boynton Canal (C-16) Fish Community Estimates**

(one 0.185 ha blocknet per year)



#### **Boynton Canal (C-16) Fish Community Estimates**

(one 0.185 ha blocknet per year)



#### **Cypress Creek Canal (C-14) Estimates** (two 0.185 ha blocknet samples per year)



#### Cypress Creek Canal (C-14) Fish Community Estimates

(two 0.185 ha blocknet samples per year)



#### **Cypress Creek Canal (C-14) Fish Community Estimates**

#### (two 0.185 ha blocknet samples per year)



Biomass (kg/ha) 1980-1984 1998-2007 Percent Change

### Exotics

61

168

+175%

Biomass (kg/ha)	1980- 1984	1998- 2007	Percent Change
Exotics	61	<mark>168</mark>	<b>+175%</b>
Natives	140	140	0%

Biomass (kg/ha)	1980- 1984	1998- 2007	Percent Change
Exotics	61	168	<b>+175%</b>
Natives	140	140	0%
All Fish	201	308	<b>+53%</b>

### **TENTATIVE FINDINGS**

Native fish communities appear far more resilient to external disturbances including those presented by exotic fishes than is generally presumed; however,

Loss of vegetation due to high Grass Carp stockings (>250 fish/ha; up to 45% of biomass) do appear to be having a direct effect on native fishes in some canals.

## MANAGEMENT OF EXOTIC FRESHWATER FISHES



Oscar (Astronotus ocellatus)

Commercial Fishing for Blue Tilapia

### Blue Tilapia (Oreochromis aureus)

Triploid Grass Carp (Ctenopharyngodon idella)

#### B U P ΤE T A E C R 0 С F K F





Butterfly Peacock (Cichla ocellaris)



Predicted Pre-Introduction Butterfly Peacock Range

### **BISCAYNE AQUIFER**

#### **CROSS SECTION**









### Tubing

### **Butterfly**

Peacock

Juvenile

Adult

Spotted Tilapia (*Tilapia mariae*)

**Butterfly Peacock Stomach Contents** 

### Butterfly Peacock (Cichla ocellaris)

Helps reduce exotic forage fishes
No known detrimental effects
Generates \$10 million annually

# Conclusions

### 1. Exotic fishes are problematic.

2. Everything practical needs to be done to prevent future illegal introductions.







### VALUES and BELIEFS



### **VALUE-NEUTRAL SCIENCE**







Walking Catfish = Catastrophe Not!



### Southeast Florida Canal Trifecta

Largemouth

Bass



John Gore 6 Feb 06 (photos by Zaremba)

### **Blue Tilapia**

## CONCLUSIONS


Seeking value-neutral answers to such questions sometimes weaken arguments favoring more restrictive regulations, larger exotic species programs, and even more funding for scientific studies that are sorely needed, for us not to ask them can only be considered rationalized dishonesty.



### Tubing

#### **Butterfly**

Peacock



Predicted Pre-Introduction Butterfly Peacock Range

Biomass (kg/ha)	1980- 1984	1998- 2006	Percent Change
All Natives	140	145	+4
All Exotics	61	168	+175
All Sportfish	81	135	+67
All Native Sportfish	81	102	+26
M/B Tilapia	8	69	+763
Bluegill	21	43	+105
Sailfin Catfish	<1	42	+420
Redear Sunfish	23	28	+22
Mayan Cichlid		26	сс
Largemouth Bass	20	22	+10
Grass Carp		18	сс
Jaguar Guapote		<1	сс
Butterfly Peacock		3	СС

M/B Tilapia	8	69	+763
Bluegill	21	43	+105
Sailfin Catfish	<1	42	+420
Redear Sunfish	23	28	+22
Mayan Cichlid		26	СС
Largemouth Bass	20	22	+10
Grass Carp		18	СС
Jaguar Guapote		<1	СС
Butterfly Peacock		3	СС





#### **Boynton Canal (C-16) Fish Community Estimates**

(one 0.185 ha blocknet sample per year)



#### **Cypress Creek Canal (C-14) Fish Community Estimates**

#### (two 0.185 ha blocknet samples per year)



## #1 PREVENTION

LAKE MEAD BOAT RENTALS VECAS

### STATE CONSTITUTION WILDLIFE CODE

## #1 PREVENTION

STATE CONSTITUTION WILDLIFE CODE

# #1 PREVENTION

STATE CONSTITUTION WILDLIFE CODE

### STATE CONSTITUTION WILDLIFE CODE

See Part

Might the presence of exotic species be more symptomatic of ecological disturbances preceding their introduction than they are the primary cause of them?

## ASSESSMENT

Non-Native Freshwater Fish Assessment and Management Laboratory At FAU in Boca Raton "A lie gets around the world before the truth can get its pants on!"

(Winston Churchill ... a long time ago)

Lesson #1: Learning to Unlearn

Walking Catfish = Catastrophe Not!

#### **Tentative Conclusions**

• Something other than the presence of highly successful and illegally introduced exotic fishes is the primary driving force in these fish communities.

• We suspect the primary forces currently driving these canal communities are the legal high density Grass Carp stockings (>250/ha; 45% of total fish biomass) that have nearly eliminated beneficial aquatic vegetation in some canals and, not too surprisingly, the climate (e.g., drought).

<b>Biomass</b>	<b>1980-</b>	<b>1998-</b>	Percent
(kg/ha)	<b>1984</b>	<b>2007</b>	Change
All Exotics	61	<b>168</b>	+175%
All Natives	140	<b>140</b>	0%
All Fish	201	308	+53%